

October 8, 2019

Walter Basic and Amy Shanks  
Planning Department  
Town of Grimsby  
160 Livingston Avenue  
Grimsby, ON  
L3M 4G3

Dear Walter and Amy:

**RE: Fifth Wheel – OPA / ZBA and Draft Plan of Subdivision – Parking Study  
Addendum Letter  
OUR FILE 14196I**

---

MHBC is pleased to provide the following Parking Study Addendum Letter in support of the Official Plan Amendment, Zoning By-law Amendment and Draft Plan of Subdivision applications for the lands located at 362-298 North Service Road in Grimsby, also known as the Fifth Wheel Lands (hereinafter referred to as the subject lands).

The overall vision for the development of the site is for a high density, mixed use redevelopment with a range of uses including a mix of residential unit types, employment and employment related uses, parkland and green space. The proposed development includes six mixed –use apartment dwellings, townhouses, as well as employment and supporting commercial uses.

The following points summarize the key findings of the parking analysis:

- The total number of required off-street vehicle parking spaces as per the Town of Grimsby Zoning By-law is **2,261** (includes apartment residential, restaurant, commercial and employment)
  - Specifically for residential apartment dwellings the parking rate is equal to 1.5 spaces / unit (1.25 / unit + 0.25 for visitor parking) for a total of **1,860** required spaces
- Given the Town's shared parking analysis for high density mixed use developments, as per Zoning By-law 14-45, the maximum required number of parking spaces at a given time is **2,053** spaces;

- **1,872** spaces are provided, including 1,820 parking spaces proposed underground for the mixed use buildings, as well as 52 spaces on Winston Road.
- The MTO lands accommodate **98** additional spaces which are suitable for visitor parking use for the foreseeable future (these have been excluded for the final parking request) for a total of 1,970 spaces.
- This results in an overall deficiency of 181 spaces, or **8.8%** of the required **2,053** spaces.

### Plan Revisions

As a result of comments received from the initial application submission and ongoing discussions with Town and Region staff, a revised plan has been prepared, which proposes the following:

- 1240 apartment units in mixed-use buildings
- 36 townhouse units
- A total of 50,515 square feet/ 4,693 square metres of employment uses
- A total of 19,493 square feet/ 1,811 square metres of commercial uses
- A total of 5,572 square feet/ 518 square metres of restaurant uses

Within the six mixed-use buildings proposed for the subject site, the following is a breakdown of the proposed uses:

**Table 1 – Land Use Breakdown for Mixed-Use Buildings**

<b>Building</b>	<b>Residential Units</b>	<b>Employment Area</b>	<b>Commercial Area</b>	<b>Restaurant Area</b>
<b>A / B</b>	491 units	5,710 square feet/ 530 square metres	N/A	5,572 square feet/ 518 square metres
<b>C</b>	178 units	N/A	10,341 square feet/ 961 square metres	N/A
<b>D</b>	177 units	N/A	9,152 square feet/ 850 square metres	N/A
<b>E</b>	151 units	21,909 square feet/ 2,035 square metres	N/A	N/A
<b>F</b>	243 units	22,896 square feet/ 2,127 square metres	N/A	N/A
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>1,240 units*</b>	<b>50,515 square feet/ 4,693 square metres</b>	<b>19,493 square feet/ 1,811 square metres</b>	<b>5,572 square feet/ 518 square metres</b>

\* Does not include townhouse dwelling units

### Previous Parking Analysis and Rate

The following table provides the required parking rates as per the initial submission:

**Table 2 – Initial Submission Parking Requirements**

<b>Resident Parking</b>	<b># of units / Gross Floor Area (m<sup>2</sup>)</b>	<b>Zoning By-law 14-45 Rate (spaces per unit or GFA)</b>	<b>Required Parking Supply (spaces)</b>
Apartment	1,247	1.25	1,559
Townhouse	38	1.5	57
Back-to-Back Townhouse	10	1.5	15
<b>Resident Total</b>	-	-	<b>1,631</b>
<b>Visitor Parking</b>			
Apartment	1,247	0.25	312
<b>Retail</b>	5,334 m <sup>2</sup>	1 space per 28 m <sup>2</sup>	191
<b>Total Parking Required</b>	<b>2,134</b>		

The initial submission required a total of 2,134 parking spaces. The initial submission proposed a total of 1,845 spaces, and an overall reduction of 14%.

### Revised Parking Analysis and Rate

The following table provides the required parking rates for the revised submission:

**Table 3 – Revised Submission Parking Requirements**

<b>Resident Parking</b>	<b># of units / Gross Floor Area (m<sup>2</sup>)</b>	<b>Zoning By-law 14-45 Rate (spaces per unit or GFA)</b>	<b>Required Parking Supply (spaces)</b>
Apartment	1,240	1.25	1,550
Townhouse	36	1.5	54
Back-to-Back Townhouse	0	1.5	0
<b>Resident Total</b>	-	-	<b>1,604</b>
<b>Visitor Parking</b>			
Apartment	1,240	0.25	310
<b>Non-Residential Uses (m<sup>2</sup>)</b>			
<b>Restaurant</b>	518	1 space per 4.5 m <sup>2</sup>	115
<b>Commercial</b>	1,811	1 space per 28 m <sup>2</sup>	65
<b>Employment</b>	4,693	1 space per 28 m <sup>2</sup>	168
<b>Total Parking Required</b>	<b>2,261</b>		

In summary, a total of 2,261 parking spaces are required based on the revised submission. This is 127 additional required spaces from the initial submission. This is largely related to the substantial increase in non-residential uses on the subject lands.

Townhouses are required to have 1.5 spaces per unit, and are proposed to have 2 parking spaces per unit and therefore are not proposed to have a parking reduction and are therefore not including in further discussion below.

**Shared Parking**

The Town of Grimsby Official Plan contemplates shared parking for high density, mixed use developments. Section 5.17 of the Town’s Zoning By-law 14-45 provides direction for the implementation of shared parking, as follows:

- a) The minimum number of parking spaces required for each use is calculated using the applicable requirements of Section 5.1 and the parking occupancy rate as set out below.

<b>Land Use</b>	<b>Parking Occupancy Rate</b>		
	<b>AM</b>	<b>PM</b>	<b>Eve</b>
<i>Apartment building</i>	80%	80%	100%
<i>Apartment building – visitor parking</i>	0%	35%	100%
<i>Restaurant</i>	20%	60%	100%
<i>Personal service shop</i>	40%	100%	70%
<i>Retail store</i>	40%	100%	90%
<i>Offices</i>	100%	95%	15%

- b) The minimum number of parking spaces required for each 2parking period is the total of the parking spaces required for all uses during that parking period
- c) The minimum number of parking spaces required for the lot is equal to the largest number of parking spaces required for any period

Applying this methodology to the required parking for the proposed development, this translates to the following number of spaces used for each use in the three given time periods outlined in the table below:

**Table 4 – Shared Parking Analysis**

<b>Required Parking</b>	<b>AM</b>	<b>PM</b>	<b>Evening</b>
Apartment Building *	1,240	1,240	1,550
Apartment Building – visitor	0	109	310
Restaurant	23	69	115
Personal Service Shop **	14	33	24
Retail Store **	7	33	30
Offices	168	160	26
<b>Total</b>	<b>1,451</b>	<b>1,642</b>	<b>2,053***</b>

*\* Townhome units are not proposed to share parking areas with other uses and therefore are excluded from the calculation.*

*\*\* At the time of the preparation of this letter, the ultimate commercial uses have not been determined. A 50/50 split between personal service shop and retail has been utilized in the above calculations for a conservative approach.*

*\*\*\*Due to rounding spaces up to the nearest whole number*

Based on the mix of uses and distribution of parking demand for the three periods identified above, shared parking for visitors and non-residential uses will provide opportunities to occupy otherwise underutilized spaces. When compared to the initial submission, a significant amount of employment and other non-residential uses are proposed for the proposed development which results in a greater amount of shared parking.

**Based on the above shared parking calculation, a total of 2,053 parking spaces are required for the proposed development.**

### **Parking Summary**

The proposed development will accommodate the majority of parking underground. Some parking is proposed to be surface parking, primarily to serve as visitor parking and parking for non-residential uses, as detailed in this letter.

**A total of 1,872 parking spaces are proposed**, including 1,820 spaces underground and 52 parking spaces are proposed to be surface parallel spaces along both sides of Winston Road. These parking spaces have been revised to be parallel spaces to minimize conflict points.

Based on the requirement of 2,053 parking spaces which implements shared parking policies, and the 1,872 provided spaces, there is a deficiency of 181 spaces and represents an 8.8% reduction in the overall required 2,053 parking spaces, for the site (excluding townhouses).

### **MTO Parking**

There are 98 additional surface parking spaces which are located on the front portion of the site, adjacent to North Service Road. This represents the portion of the lands which will continue to be held by the Ministry of Transportation (MTO) for future potential Highway improvements. As a result, a 14 metre setback is required and these parking spaces cannot be counted towards zoning by-law requirements. However it is anticipated that they will provide opportunities for parking for visitors to residential units, non-residential uses, the waterfront trail and the park areas.

Until such time as these lands are required by MTO, the lands are proposed to be strategically incorporated into the overall site design as shared surface level parking for visitors and retail uses. While these spaces have not been included in the proposed parking count, they provide a significant amount of spaces available for use. A total of 98 parking spaces are proposed to be accommodated by the MTO lands in addition to the **1872** proposed. These spaces will function as visitor spaces and also offer a unique and convenient opportunity for accessible parking spaces.

When based on the shared parking calculation above, this results in an overall deficiency of 181 spaces or 8.8%, of the overall required 2,053 spaces. The MTO lands provide for a total of

98 additional parking spaces to the 1,872 proposed parking spaces, for a total of 1,970 spaces. **With the addition of the 98 MTO parking spaces, this would be equivalent to a deficiency of 82 spaces or 4% overall.**

### **Transportation Demand Management**

Although the Town of Grimsby's Official Plan does not contain specific policies related to Transportation Demand Management (TDM), the Region of Niagara's approved (October 2017) Transportation Master Plan provides that TDM aims to influence travel behaviour. The following TDM measures are proposed as part of the proposed redevelopment:

- 1) Transit - The existing GO bus station is located within walking distance and provides service for Route 12 which travels between St. Catharine's and Burlington and offers connections to the Lakeshore West Line in Burlington with service to Union Station and beyond. The proposed GO train station is planned to be located in this location when GO train service is extended to Niagara, which is currently planned for 2021. The Town of Grimsby's recently approved Secondary Plan for the Go Station Area confirms the commitment to providing this service.
- 2) Secure Bicycle Parking – Bicycle parking is proposed to be provided as required in Zoning By-law 14-45, which requires a rate of 0.3 spaces / unit for apartment dwellings for a total of 372 spaces. Additional outdoor bicycle parking spaces will be provided for non-residential uses and visitors to the residential, non-residential and public parkland.
- 3) Active Transportation - The Fifth Wheel lands will provide connections to a future continuous waterfront pedestrian and active mode trail running east and west of the subject lands along the Lake Ontario Shoreline.
- 4) Unbundled Parking - Unbundled parking provides a disincentive for single-occupant vehicle ownership. Parking for the proposed development is recommended to be unbundled, or charged separately, from the cost of the unit. This practice will help maintain a reduced demand for parking on site as it allows the tenant, or user to understand the full-cost of their travel behavior and choices.
- 5) Access to Non-Residential Uses - Non-residential uses are proposed on-site, including employment uses, supporting retail and restaurant uses, intended to serve the immediate needs of residents living on-site and employees working on site. 1.303 hectares of parkland are also proposed on the Lake Ontario Shoreline. It is expected that this park, in combination with the proposed waterfront trail, will adequately serve the recreation needs of residents on site and reduce the need to travel to other parks in the Town.

It is our opinion that these above noted TDM measures further support the request for a reduction in the proposed parking rate.

### **Proposed Parking Reduction**

Overall, the proposed development seeks a total reduction of 181 spaces, once the shared parking arrangement is considered, or 8.8% overall.

Under the current Zoning By-law, for apartment dwellings, parking is to be provided at a rate of 1.25 spaces per unit and 0.25 visitor spaces per unit for an effective rate of 1.5 spaces per unit. The following table provides a breakdown of ways the request for a parking reduction could be considered, which all yield the same total number of parking spaces:

**Table 5 – Parking Reduction Analysis**

<b>Residential Parking Rate</b>	<b>Visitor Parking Rate</b>	<b>Total Number of Residential Spaces</b>	<b>Total Number of Non-Res. Spaces</b>	<b>Total Number of Spaces</b>
1.25 spaces / unit	0.1 spaces / unit	1,674	195*	1,869
1.20 spaces / unit	0.15 spaces / unit	1,674	195*	1,869
1.15 spaces / unit	0.2 spaces / unit	1,674	195*	1,869

\* Based on the shared parking calculation for the site during the peak period (evening)

**The requested parking rate for apartment dwellings is 1.2 spaces per unit, and 0.15 spaces per unit for visitor parking. This rate will allow for an effective rate of 1.35 spaces per unit.**

**Conclusion**

Through discussions with staff it has been identified that the greatest parking reduction recently approved have provided an overall parking reduction of 7% (AquaZul by DeSantis). We believe that given the size, scale and location of the Fifth Wheel lands a reduction of 10% to the proposed overall parking rate is reflective of other recent approvals and is supportive by the Official Plan and Zoning By-law.

In addition, while a reduction in the visitor parking rate is proposed, shared parking is proposed, and an additional 98 parking spaces are available on the MTO portion of the lands, which will function as visitor parking spaces. The reduction in visitor parking spaces will allow for an efficient use of land and resources.

The overall deficiency proposed is 181 spaces or 8.8%, of the overall required 2,053 spaces. The MTO lands provide for a total of 98 additional parking spaces to the 1,872 proposed parking spaces, for a total of 1,970 spaces. With the consideration of the 98 MTO parking spaces, this would be equivalent to a deficiency of 82 spaces or 4% overall.

**It is our opinion that given the proposed uses on site, the location of the site, the availability of shared parking, TDM measures, and the large portion of non-residential spaces provided, as well as the additional MTO parking spaces, it is appropriate to request a reduction for the residential apartment dwellings to 1.2, and visitor parking spaces to 0.15 per dwelling unit. Therefore, a rate of 1.35 per unit is proposed overall.**

In summary, based on the above analysis, we believe the proposed reduction is appropriate for the subject lands.

Yours truly,  
**MHBC**